

# *Subvention from parent company for making good losses is a capital receipt not chargeable to tax*

December 14, 2016

## ***In brief***

The Supreme Court (SC) recently held that subvention received by an Indian company from the parent company to make good the losses incurred by it, was in the nature of a capital receipt. The SC arrived at this conclusion on the ground that the subvention was a voluntary payment made by the parent company in Germany to protect the capital investment in the subsidiary company.

The SC further distinguished its earlier decisions in the case of Ponni Sugars<sup>2</sup> and Sahney Steel<sup>3</sup> on the grounds that in those cases, the subsidies were received as a grant-in-aid from public funds and not by way of a voluntary contribution from the parent company.

## ***In detail***

### ***Facts***

- The taxpayer<sup>1</sup> was engaged in the business of manufacture of electronic products and computer software. For the relevant assessment year, the taxpayer had filed its return of income declaring a loss.
- During the relevant assessment year, the taxpayer had received monies from its parent company which were not offered to tax by the taxpayer.
- During the course of the assessment proceedings, the taxpayer stated that the monies represented subvention payments by the parent company to make good the losses incurred by

the taxpayer and as the taxpayer did not have sufficient working capital, the parent company infused further capital. The taxpayer claimed these payments to be capital in nature.

- The tax officer rejected this stand of the taxpayer and treated such receipt as a revenue receipt taxable in the hands of the taxpayer.
- The Commissioner of Income-tax (Appeals) and the Income-tax Appellate Tribunal (Tribunal) agreed with the contention of the taxpayer and deleted the addition to the taxpayer's income.
- On further appeal by the Revenue authorities, the High Court (HC) reversed the order of the Tribunal

and upheld the addition made by the tax officer.

- The ruling of the HC was on the principle laid down by the SC in the cases of Ponni Sugars<sup>2</sup> and Sahney Steel<sup>3</sup> which say that the purpose of the subsidy or subvention is relevant, and unless the subsidy is towards assistance for setting up or expanding of business or repayment of loan or creation of a new asset, it would be revenue in nature. The HC held that the subvention was to make good the losses and run the business more profitably, and hence the subvention was a revenue receipt taxable in the hands of the taxpayer.

<sup>1</sup> SPL (C) Nos. 6946/ 2014

<sup>2</sup> CIT v. Ponni Sugars and Chemicals Limited (2008) 9 SCC 337

<sup>3</sup> Sahney Steel & Press Works Ltd. v. CIT (1997) 7 SCC 764

### ***Ruling of the Supreme Court***

- The SC distinguished the present case from its earlier decisions in the cases of Ponni Sugars<sup>2</sup> and Sahney Steels<sup>3</sup> on the basis that in those decisions, the subsidy or assistance in question was from public funds (government subsidies) and not voluntary contributions from the parent company.
- Further, the SC held that the voluntary payments by the parent company to the taxpayer to make good its losses was with a view to protect its capital investment in the taxpayer.

- Accordingly, the SC upheld the contention of the taxpayer and reversed the decision of the HC.
- The SC also drew reference from and agreed with the decision of the Delhi HC in the case of Handicrafts and Handlooms Export Corporation of India<sup>4</sup> where, on similar facts, the Delhi HC had held that subsidy was a capital receipt, as the payment was to secure and protect the capital investment.

### ***The takeaways***

- The ruling of the SC supports the position

that any assistance or subvention received from parent companies are capital receipts.

- The amendment to section 2(24)(xviii) relating to inclusion of subsidies and grants within the ambit of “income” may not be applicable unless the same are received from the Government or its agencies.

### ***Let’s talk***

For a deeper discussion of how this issue might affect your business, please contact your local PwC advisor.

---

<sup>4</sup> CIT v. Handicrafts and Handlooms Export Corporation of India (2014) 49 taxmann.com 488 (Delhi)

## ***Our Offices***

### ***Ahmedabad***

1701, 17th Floor, Shapath V,  
Opp. Karnavati Club,  
S G Highway,  
Ahmedabad – 380051  
Gujarat  
+91-79 3091 7000

### ***Hyderabad***

Plot no. 77/A, 8-2-624/A/1, 4th  
Floor, Road No. 10, Banjara Hills,  
Hyderabad – 500034,  
Telangana  
+91-40 44246000

### ***Gurgaon***

Building No. 10, Tower - C  
17th & 18th Floor,  
DLF Cyber City,  
Gurgaon – 122002  
Haryana  
+91-124 330 6000

### ***Bengaluru***

6th Floor  
Millenia Tower 'D'  
1 & 2, Murphy Road, Ulsoor,  
Bengaluru – 560 008  
Karnataka  
+91-80 4079 7000

### ***Kolkata***

56 & 57, Block DN.  
Ground Floor, A- Wing  
Sector - V, Salt Lake  
Kolkata – 700 091,  
West Bengal  
+91-033 2357 9101/  
4400 1111

### ***Pune***

7th Floor, Tower A - Wing 1,  
Business Bay, Airport Road,  
Yerwada, Pune – 411 006  
Maharashtra  
+91-20 4100 4444

### ***Chennai***

8th Floor  
Prestige Palladium Bayan  
129-140 Greaves Road  
Chennai – 600 006  
Tamil Nadu  
+91 44 4228 5000

### ***Mumbai***

PwC House  
Plot No. 18A,  
Guru Nanak Road (Station Road),  
Bandra (West), Mumbai – 400 050  
Maharashtra  
+91-22 6689 1000

### ***For more information***

Contact us at  
[pwctrs.knowledgemanagement@in.pwc.com](mailto:pwctrs.knowledgemanagement@in.pwc.com)

## ***About PwC***

At PwC, our purpose is to build trust in society and solve important problems. We're a network of firms in 157 countries with more than 223,000 people who are committed to delivering quality in assurance, advisory and tax services. Find out more and tell us what matters to you by visiting us at [www.pwc.com](http://www.pwc.com).

In India, PwC has offices in these cities: Ahmedabad, Bengaluru, Chennai, Delhi NCR (Gurgaon), Hyderabad, Kolkata, Mumbai and Pune. For more information about PwC India's service offerings, visit [www.pwc.com/in](http://www.pwc.com/in)

PwC refers to the PwC International network and/or one or more of its member firms, each of which is a separate, independent and distinct legal entity. Please see [www.pwc.com/structure](http://www.pwc.com/structure) for further details.

©2016 PwC. All rights reserved

## ***Follow us on:***



For private circulation only

This publication has been prepared for general guidance on matters of interest only, and does not constitute professional advice. You should not act upon the information contained in this publication without obtaining specific professional advice. No representation or warranty (express or implied) is given as to the accuracy or completeness of the information contained in this publication, and, to the extent permitted by law, PwCPL, its members, employees and agents accept no liability, and disclaim all responsibility, for the consequences of you or anyone else acting, or refraining to act, in reliance on the information contained in this publication or for any decision based on it. Without prior permission of PwCPL, this publication may not be quoted in whole or in part or otherwise referred to in any documents.

© 2016 PricewaterhouseCoopers Private Limited. All rights reserved. In this document, "PwC" refers to PricewaterhouseCoopers Private Limited (a limited liability company in India having Corporate Identity Number or CIN : U74140WB1983PTC036093), which is a member firm of PricewaterhouseCoopers International Limited (PwCIL), each member firm of which is a separate legal entity.